REPORT TITLE: PLANNING APPEAL DECISIONS

27 APRIL 2017

REPORT OF PORTFOLIO HOLDER: CLLR VICTORIA WESTON, DEPUTY LEADER AND PORTFOLIO HOLDER FOR BUILT ENVIRONMENT

Contact Officer: Julie Pinnock, Head of Development Management Tel No: 01962 848439 Email jpinnock@winchester.gov.uk

WARD(S): ALL

### **PURPOSE**

This report provides a summary of appeal decisions in relation to planning case received during 1 October 2016 to 31 March 2017.

# **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. That the report be noted.

## **IMPLICATIONS:**

- 1 COUNCIL STRATEGY OUTCOME
- 1.1 Analysis of appeal decisions ensures consistency in decision making helping the City Council to protect the Environment.
- 2 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS
- 2.1 None
- 3 LEGAL AND PROCUREMENT IMPLICATIONS
- 3.1 None
- 4 WORKFORCE IMPLICATIONS
- 4.1 None
- 5 PROPERTY AND ASSET IMPLICATIONS
- 5.1 None
- 6 CONSULTATION AND COMMUNICATION
- 6.1 Not applicable report for information.
- 7 <u>ENVIRONMENTAL CONSIDERATIONS</u>
- 7.1 None
- 8 <u>EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT</u>
- 8.1 None
- 9 RISK MANAGEMENT

Risk	Mitigation	Opportunities
Property N/A		
Community Support N/A		
Timescales N/A		
Project capacity N/A		
Financial / VfM N/A		
Legal N/A		
Innovation N/A		
Reputation N/A		
Other N/A		

#### 10 SUPPORTING INFORMATION:

10.1 This report provides a summary of appeal decisions in relation to planning cases received during 1st October 2016 – 31st March 2017.

#### 1 October 2016 – 31 December 2016

11 Appeal Decisions Received

6 appeals were allowed – 54%

4 appeals were dismissed – 36%

1 appeal was withdrawn - 10%

There were 2 claims for cost against the Council. 1 claim was dismissed and the other claim was allowed.

The Council won a claim for costs.

### 1 January 2017 - 31 March 2017

18 Appeal Decisions Received

3 Allowed (17%)

13 Dismissed (72%)

2 Withdrawn (11%)

There were 2 claims for costs against the council. 1 claim was dismissed and the other claim was allowed in part.

#### 11 OTHER OPTIONS CONSIDERED AND REJECTED

#### 11.1 None

BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS:- Relevant planning applications files,

Previous Committee Reports:- PDC1070, PDC1060

#### **APPENDICES:**

Appendix 1 – Summary of decisions (Planning cases) 1 October 2016 – 31 December 2016

Appendix 2 – Summary of decisions (Planning cases) 1 January 2017 – 31 March 2017

# Appendix 1

A summary of appeal decisions received during the period 1 October 2016 - 31 December 2016

Item No:1			
Date of Inspector's	5th December	Inspector's	Appeal Allowed
Decision:	2016	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	I	Costs:	Costs Allowed
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H – Householder			

Case No:	14/02394/FUL		
Case Officer:		Mr Stephen Cornwell	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	(RESUBMISSION) Siting of a mobile home (RETROSPECTIVE)
Location:	Woodley Farm Alma Lane Upham Hampshire SO32 1HE

Item No:2						
Date of Inspector's	11th October	Inspector's	Appeal Allowed			
Decision:	2016	Decision:				
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	Costs Refused			
(see code below):						
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;						
				P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder		

Case No:	16/00047/FUL	
Case Officer:		Liz Marsden
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	Change of use from office (A1) to Dwelling house (C3) (MAY
	AFFECT THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING)
Location:	Adams Hendry 7 St Peter Street Winchester Hampshire SO23 8BW

Item No:3			
Date of Inspector's	5th October	Inspector's	Appeal Allowed
Decision:	2016	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	I	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
D. Dublia harving II. Havsahaldar			

**P** – Public Inquiry; **H** - Householder

Case No:	16/00161/FUL		
Case Officer:		Mr Stephen Cornwell	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	The siting of a mobile home for a temporary period of 3 years for occupation by a worker employed at Chestnut Cattery
Location:	Chestnut Cattery Chantilly Wickham Common North Boarhunt
	Fareham Hampshire

Item No:4			
Date of Inspector's Decision:	12th December 2016	Inspector's Decision:	Appeal Allowed
Appeal Procedure (see code below):	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
W - Written representat	ion: I – Informa	l hearing:	

W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;
 P – Public Inquiry;
 H - Householder

Case No:	15/02861/LDP	
Case Officer:	Officer: Michaela Mercer	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	Proposed to use the land for stationing of holiday caravans for 12 months of the year with a maximum of 30 caravans for residential occupation.
Location:	Wickham Court Blackhouse Lane North Boarhunt Fareham Hampshire PO17 6JS

Item No:5				
Date of Inspector's	27th October	Inspector's	Appeal Allowed	
Decision:	2016	Decision:		
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs	
(see code below):				
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;				
D. Dublio Inquiru H. Householder				

Case No:	15/02902/FUL	
Case Officer:		Mrs Anna Hebard
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	(HOUSEHOLDER) Removal of current fence around the boundary
	of our property, and professional replacement with 1800mm high
	wooden fencing. (RETROSPECTIVE)
Location:	2 Park Close Winchester Hampshire SO23 7BD

Item No:6			
Date of Inspector's	22nd	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	November	Decision:	
	2016		
Appeal Procedure	Н	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/00415/TPO	
Case Officer:		Mr Ivan Gurdler
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	1 no. oak tree to crown reduce and lift by 5m.
Location:	Thelma Cottage Forest Road Denmead Waterlooville Hampshire
	PO7 6UA

Item No:7			
Date of Inspector's	2nd	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	December	Decision:	
	2016		
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W - Written representa	tion; I – Informa	al hearing;	•
P - Public Inquiry; H - H	łouseholder		

Case No:	15/00758/FUL		
Case Officer:		Russell Stock	
Original Decision Type:		Committee Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Proposed new three bedroom house (WITHIN THE CURTILAGE OF A LISTED BUILDING) (AMENDED PLANS 14.01.16)
Location:	Tudor Cottage 22 Church Lane Kings Worthy Winchester Hampshire SO23 7QS

Item No:8			
Date of Inspector's	28th	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	December	Decision:	
	2016		
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/00926/PNCOU	
Case Officer:	Liz Marsden	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	Conversion of the rear building from storage and distribution (Use
	Class B8) into 1 residential unit (Use Class C3) under Class P of
	the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development)
	(England) Order 2015.
Location:	Gentian House Moorside Road Winchester Hampshire SO23 7RX

Item No:9			
Date of Inspector's	13th	Inspector's	Application Withdrawn
Decision:	December	Decision:	
	2016		
Appeal Procedure	I	Costs:	Appellants Costs Dismissed
(see code below):			WCC Costs allowed.
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/00874/FUL	
Case Officer:		Mrs Jill Lee
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	Change of Use of Agricultural Building to a Dwellinghouse (Use Class C3)Change of use of the first floor of the barn from agricultural to C3 residential to enable a full time worker to reside and fulfill the functional requirement of the farm post (RETROSPECTIVE)
Location:	Sutton Springs Trout Fishery Bullington Lane Sutton Scotney Winchester Hampshire SO21 3RA

Item No:10			
Date of Inspector's	2nd	Inspector's	Appeal Allowed
Decision:	December	Decision:	
	2016		
Appeal Procedure	Н	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/01122/AVC	
Case Officer:		Russell Stock
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	1 no. internally illuminated fascia sign and illuminated Wickes
	lettering on the existing free standing totem sign.
Location:	Unit 1-2 Easton Lane Winchester SO23 7RU

Item No:11			
Date of Inspector's	2nd	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	December	Decision:	
	2016		
Appeal Procedure		Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/00430/FUL	
Case Officer:		Liz Marsden
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	PROPOSED GARAGE	
Location:	19 Archery Lane Winchester Hampshire SO23 8GG	

# Appendix 2

A summary of appeal decisions received during the period 1 January 2017 - 31 March 2017

10

Item No: 1			
Date of Inspector's	10th March	Inspector's	Appeal Allowed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	I	Costs:	Partial award of costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	15/00636/FUL		
Case Officer:		Mr Stephen Cornwell	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Variation of condition no. 1 (occupancy condition) and removal of condition number no. 3 occupancy condition and expiry of permitted use by 18 October 2015) of planning permission 12/02253/FUL (Land opposite Belmont Farm)
Location:	Barn Farm Caravan Park The Lakes Swanmore Hampshire

Item No: 2			
Date of Inspector's	10th March	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representa	ition; I – Informa	l hearing;	•
P - Public Inquiry: H - I	Householder		

Case No:	15/01968/FUL	
Case Officer:	Nicholas Billington	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	Change of use of the existing dwellinghouse (C3) to 10 bed House
	in Multiple Occupancy (sui-generis) and retention of front boundary

	fence (RESUBMISSION) (RETROSPECTIVE)
Location:	86 Cromwell Road Winchester Hampshire SO22 4AE

11

Item No:3			
Date of Inspector's	7th March	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	I	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representat	ion; I – Informa	al hearing;	
P - Public Inquiry: H - H	louseholder		

Case No:	15/02863/LDC	
Case Officer:		Michaela Mercer
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	Continued use of land as a domestic garden (C3)
Location:	Butlers Arlebury Park House Arlebury Park Alresford Hampshire
	SO24 9ER

Item No:4			
Date of Inspector's	21st February	Inspector's	Appeal Allowed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	Н	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/00801/TPO	
Case Officer:		Stefan Kowalczyk
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at		No
Committee?		

Proposal:	1 no. Norway Maple to reduce lateral branches by 3m, remove deadwood and Ivy
Location:	West Downs Student Village Romsey Road Winchester Hampshire SO22 5HT

1	2	

Item No:5			
Date of Inspector's	12th January	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
D. Dublic bassimu II. Hassachalden			

Case No:	16/00142/FUL		
Case Officer:		Liz Marsden	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision	Overturned at	No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Erection of a 5 bedroom detached dwelling with a detached garage (RESUBMISSION - 15/02048/FUL)
Location:	Land Adjacent Lodge Green Whiteley Lane Titchfield Hampshire PO15 6RW

Item No:6			
Date of Inspector's	17th January	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	Н	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/00685/TPO	
Case Officer:		David Townsend
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision
Was Decision	Overturned at	No
Committee?		

Proposal:	3no. hornbeams to crown reduce by 5-8 m each
Location:	18 Grange Road Winchester Hampshire SO23 9RT

Item No:7			
Date of Inspector's	24th February	Inspector's	Appeal Allowed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	I	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry: H - Householder			

Case No: 15/02610/FUL	-
Case Officer:	Mrs Katie Nethersole
Original Decision Type:	Delegated Decision
Was Decision Overturned at	No
Committee?	

Proposal:	Removal of condition 3 to permitted permission 00/00735/FUL 'Detached four bedroom dwelling' (RESUBMISSION)
Location:	Frys Farm Ingoldfield Lane Soberton Southampton Hampshire SO32 3QA

Item No:8			
Date of Inspector's	20th February	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

<b>Case No:</b> 15/02942/FUL	
Case Officer:	Lisa Booth
Original Decision Type:	Committee Decision
Was Decision Overturned at	No
Committee?	

Proposal:	New dwelling and garage on previously developed land.
Location:	Yule Cottage Winters Road Shirrell Heath Hampshire

Item No:9			
Date of Inspector's	17th February	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/01048/FUL	
Case Officer:		Nick Parker
Original Deci	sion Type:	Committee Decision
Was Decision	Vas Decision Overturned at No	
Committee?		

Proposal:	Removal of condition 26 of 13/00212/FUL pedestrian access.
Location:	Wykeham Court Winchester Road Wickham Hampshire

Item No:10			
Date of Inspector's	3rd March	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	Costs Refused.
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry: H - Householder			

Case No:	16/01465/FUL	
Case Officer:		Russell Stock
Original Decis	ion Type:	Committee Decision
Was Decision	Overturned at	No
Committee?		

Proposal:	Conversion of an existing portal framed barn to residential use, with
	the provision of an associated residential curtilage for the proposed
	dwelling.
Location:	Watley Farm Locks Lane Sparsholt SO21 2LU

Item No:11			
Date of Inspector's	6th March	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			

Case No:	16/00520/FUL		
Case Officer:	Case Officer: Mrs Katie Nethersole		
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Change of use of the existing dwellinghouse (C3) to 8 bed House in
	Multiple Occupancy (sui-generis) and associated parking
	(resubmission of application 15/02875/FUL).
Location:	12 Thurmond Road Winchester Hampshire SO22 4DE

Item No:12			
Date of Inspector's	9th February	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	Н	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/01566/FUL		
Case Officer:		Mrs Katie Nethersole	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Loft Conversion with Rear Dormer and jullette Window
Location:	23 Knowle Avenue Knowle Fareham Hampshire PO17 5LG

Item No:13			
Date of Inspector's	9th February	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	Н	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
B			

**P** – Public Inquiry; **H** - Householder

Case No:	16/01642/FUL		
Case Officer:	Case Officer: Russell Stock		
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Retrospective application for the installation of 14 solar panels
Location:	Pembroke Cottage Bishops Sutton Road Bishops Sutton Alresford
	Hampshire SO24 0AA

Item No:14			
Date of Inspector's	16th March	Inspector's	Appeal Withdrawn
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	Р	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P Dublic Inquiry: H - Householder			

Case No:	16/01097/LDC		
Case Officer:		Michaela Mercer	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Change of use of land from orchard to residential curtilage
	(CERTIFICATE OF LAWFULNESS)
Location:	Belmore Cottages Manor Road Durley Hampshire

Item No:15			
Date of Inspector's	17th February	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	Н	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry: H - Householder			

Case No:	16/02518/HOU		
Case Officer: Lindsay McCorkell		Lindsay McCorkell	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Amendment to approved planning application 15/02895/FUL to
	allow for second floor dormer on rear elevation.
Location:	Kilchelwin 41 Wesley Road Kings Worthy SO23 7PX

Item No:16			
Date of Inspector's	9th February	Inspector's	Appeal Withdrawn
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representation; I – Informal hearing;			
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/02310/FUL		
Case Officer:		Mrs Jill Lee	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Change of use of the ground floor only of a redundant barn from agricultural to garaging ancillary to the existing dwelling. No proposed new works.
Location:	Sutton Springs Trout Fishery Bullington Lane Sutton Scotney Winchester Hampshire SO21 3RA

	_
-1	×
	()

Item No:17			
Date of Inspector's	27th March	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	W	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representati	on; I – Informa	I hearing;	
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/00287/FUL		
Case Officer:		Nick Parker	
Original Decision Type:		Delegated Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at No		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Erection of 1 no. 1 bed flat with garages beneath, 2 no. 2 bed
	houses, 1 no. 3 bed house with associated parking.
Location:	Former Gas Works Garfield Road Bishops Waltham Hampshire

Item No:18			
Date of Inspector's	8th March	Inspector's	Appeal Dismissed
Decision:	2017	Decision:	
Appeal Procedure	Н	Costs:	No Application for Costs
(see code below):			
W – Written representati	on; I – Informal	hearing;	
P – Public Inquiry; H - Householder			

Case No:	16/02064/FUL		
Case Officer:		Russell Stock	
Original Decision Type:		Committee Decision	
Was Decision Overturned at		No	
Committee?			

Proposal:	Demolition of existing detached garage, alterations and extensions
	to existing property to include raising the ridge to form first floor
	accommodation, 2 storey side and rear extensions and single
	storey rear extension to include integral garage
Location:	17 Collins Lane Hursley SO21 2JX